

**Subject:** RE: [Fwd: Re: [Fwd: Re: MISTAKEN INFERENCE]]

**From:** "Walsh, Chris \ (Committees\)"

**Date:** Thu, 28 May 2009 16:45:50 +0100

**To:** "Coyne, John"

**CC:** "Hilton, Colin \ (Chief Executive\)"

[John see attached draft.](#)

Chris Walsh  
Head of Committee Services  
Legal Services - Liverpool City Council  
Direct Line: 0151 225 2432  
Mobile number: 07764 621401  
Fax Number 0151 225 2427

---

**From:** John Coyne [mailto:councillor-john.coyne@zen.co.uk]  
**Sent:** 28 May 2009 11:19  
**To:** Hilton, Colin (Chief Executive)  
**Cc:** Coyne, John; Walsh, Chris (Committees)  
**Subject:** Re: [Fwd: Re: [Fwd: Re: MISTAKEN INFERENCE]]

Then it's simple. May I have that draft?  
JC

Hilton, Colin (Chief Executive) wrote:

John  
A draft on the subject was supplied to the Leaders office which was then amended, as is normal, by the Leaders office.  
Colin Hilton  
Chief Executive  
Liverpool City Council

Sent from my BlackBerry Wireless Handheld

---

**From:** John Coyne <councillor-john.coyne@zen.co.uk>  
**To:** Hilton, Colin (Chief Executive)  
**Cc:** Coyne, John; Walsh, Chris (Committees)  
**Sent:** Thu May 28 10:47:01 2009  
**Subject:** Re: [Fwd: Re: [Fwd: Re: MISTAKEN INFERENCE]]

Colin,  
Are you saying that the reply came entirely from the Leader's office and that no officer in Planning or in the Homeless service informed the Leader or his office in constructing that reply?  
Regards,  
John

Hilton, Colin (Chief Executive) wrote:

John

I think this is getting a bit like ping pong because you are introducing a false premise into your question. The straight reply is below:

\*who it was in Planning who gave the advice that ward councillors had opposed the use of the centre in St Michaels;

No planning officer gave that advice

\*the text of that advice;

See above

\*who received and acted on that advice

See above

\*who reported that action to the Leader's office

See above

\*the text of that report.

See above

As I have indicated previously to you the position in respect of ward councillors was subject to misinterpretation. The Leaders reply to you at the last Council meeting gives further weight to this view. I suggest you will only progress the matter by discussing with the Leader why, based on your correspondance as quoted, he views that as opposition to the proposal on your part.

Colin Hilton  
Chief Executive  
Liverpool City Council

Sent from my BlackBerry Wireless Handheld

---

**From:** John Coyne <[councillor-john.coyne@zen.co.uk](mailto:councillor-john.coyne@zen.co.uk)>

**To:** Hilton, Colin (Chief Executive)

**Cc:** Walsh, Chris (Committees)

**Sent:** Wed May 27 01:07:15 2009

**Subject:** [Fwd: Re: [Fwd: Re: MISTAKEN INFERENCE]]

Colin,

Will you please disclose

- who it was in Planning who gave the advice that ward councillors had opposed the use of the centre in St Michaels;
- the text of that advice;
- who received and acted on that advice
- who reported that action to the Leader's office
- the text of that report.

Regards,

John Coyne

Green Party councillor for St Michaels Ward

----- Original Message -----

**Subject:** Re: [Fwd: Re: MISTAKEN INFERENCE]

**Date:** Thu, 23 Apr 2009 08:42:25 +0100

**From:** John Coyne <[councillor-john.coyne@zen.co.uk](mailto:councillor-john.coyne@zen.co.uk)>

**Reply-To:** [john.coyne@liverpool.gov.uk](mailto:john.coyne@liverpool.gov.uk)

**To:** Hilton, Colin (Chief Executive) <[Colin.Hilton@liverpool.gov.uk](mailto:Colin.Hilton@liverpool.gov.uk)>

**CC:** Coyne, John <[John.Coyne@liverpool.gov.uk](mailto:John.Coyne@liverpool.gov.uk)>, Walsh, Chris (Committees) <[Chris.Walsh@liverpool.gov.uk](mailto:Chris.Walsh@liverpool.gov.uk)>

**References:** <[8515978A180D144EA1B4FBC39B4C256C03EAE46E@VSMAIL2.resource.local](mailto:8515978A180D144EA1B4FBC39B4C256C03EAE46E@VSMAIL2.resource.local)>

Thanks, Colin.

I do not think any defamation was intended and I look forward to full disclosure of the origin of the inaccuracy so that I can be confirmed in that view.

Defamation, in my view, has arisen from others and the misreporting by officers may have helped a defamatory controversy to be created.

John

Hilton, Colin (Chief Executive) wrote:

John

I am in Shanghai so I have left this in Chris Walsh's hands to follow up. I should however say that I believe this does not constitute a matter of defamation but of misreporting and inaccuracy.

Colin Hilton  
Chief Executive  
Liverpool City Council

Sent from my BlackBerry Wireless Handheld

---

**From:** John Coyne <[councillor-john.coyne@zen.co.uk](mailto:councillor-john.coyne@zen.co.uk)>

**To:** Hilton, Colin (Chief Executive)

**Cc:** Horner, Andy; Jennings, Sarah

**Sent:** Wed Apr 22 21:42:23 2009

**Subject:** [Fwd: Re: MISTAKEN INFERENCE]

Colin,

While we are waiting for a response on the questions I put to you on Friday, I request that the city council's web site removes the inaccurate (and defamatory) reporting of local councillors' views in the Q&A of 28th January.

[6. Street homelessness & help for rough sleepers by Cllr L Williams, item 83](#)

Please arrange to remove the final paragraph which you have acknowledged is in error.

Regards,

John Coyne  
Councillor for St Michaels Ward

----- Original Message -----

**Subject:** Re: MISTAKEN INFERENCE

**Date:** Fri, 17 Apr 2009 18:31:03 +0100

**From:** John Coyne <[councillor-john.coyne@zen.co.uk](mailto:councillor-john.coyne@zen.co.uk)>

**Reply-To:** [john.coyne@liverpool.gov.uk](mailto:john.coyne@liverpool.gov.uk)

**To:** Hilton, Colin (Chief Executive) <[Colin.Hilton@liverpool.gov.uk](mailto:Colin.Hilton@liverpool.gov.uk)>

Coyne, John <[John.Coyne@liverpool.gov.uk](mailto:John.Coyne@liverpool.gov.uk)>, Farnos, Rob  
**CC:** <[Rob.Farnos@liverpool.gov.uk](mailto:Rob.Farnos@liverpool.gov.uk)>, Lee, Nigel  
<[Nigel.Lee@liverpool.gov.uk](mailto:Nigel.Lee@liverpool.gov.uk)>

**References:** <[8515978A180D144EA1B4FBC39B4C256C03EAE438@VSMAIL2.resource.local](mailto:8515978A180D144EA1B4FBC39B4C256C03EAE438@VSMAIL2.resource.local)>

Thank you, Colin.

As you may know, this issue is at the centre of a defamatory controversy.

Can you be more precise:

- was the drafting done by an officer?
- who and when?
- what safeguards could be put in place to prevent a recurrence - adverse inferences being made about the views of one councillor in the context of the answer to a Council Question from another councillor?

Regards,  
John

Hilton, Colin (Chief Executive) wrote:

**John**

**Having had further information this afternoon I believe that the misinterpretation has arisen as a result of the drafting of a reply for the Leader which has turned local concerns (i.e. those of residents) into local ward councillors. Error rather than conspiracy but apologies nevertheless.**

Colin Hilton

Chief Executive

**LIVERPOOL CITY COUNCIL**

---

DISCLAIMER:

The information in this e-mail is confidential and may be read, copied or used only by the intended recipient(s). If you have received it in error please contact the sender immediately by returning the e-mail or by telephoning a number contained in the body of the e-mail then and please delete the e-mail without disclosing its contents elsewhere. No responsibility is accepted for loss or damage arising from viruses or changes made to this message after it was sent. The views contained in this email are those of the author and not necessarily those of the authors employer or service provider.

This email has been automatically scanned for viruses and malicious content by MessageLabs for your protection

---

---

This email has been automatically scanned for viruses and malicious content by MessageLabs for your protection

---

---

DISCLAIMER:

The information in this e-mail is confidential and may be read, copied or used only by the intended recipient(s). If you have received it in error please contact the sender immediately by returning the e-mail or by telephoning a number contained in the body of the e-mail then and please delete the e-mail without disclosing its contents elsewhere. No responsibility is accepted for loss or damage arising from viruses or changes made to this message after it was sent. The views contained in this email are those of the author and not necessarily those of the author's employer or service provider.

This email has been automatically scanned for viruses and malicious content by MessageLabs for your protection

---